



**“Dual Apprenticeship: a part of the Right to education.  
Challenges and perspectives”**  
**High-Level Panel during the XXXII<sup>e</sup> Session of the Human Rights Council of  
the United Nations**

Project of a Cross-regional Declaration on the role of Dual System of Vocational  
Education and Training in the realization of the right to education



**Palais des Nations, Geneva,  
April 29th, 2016**

Achieved by Apprentissages Sans Frontières (ASF)



## Table of Contents

|   |           |
|---|-----------|
| <b>1. General Context.....</b>  | <b>3</b>  |
| <b>2. Opening statements and introduction .....</b>   | <b>4</b>  |
| <b>3. Thematic presentation .....</b>   | <b>5</b>  |
| <b>4. Experiencing training through Dual VET: a practical reality .....</b>   | <b>6</b>  |
| Vocational training in the context of Switzerland: the example of the Canton of Geneva, Mrs Natacha Juda.....   | 6         |
| Current reforms regarding vocational education and training policies in Senega, M. Aboubacar Barry .....  | 8         |
| The Role of Dual System of Vocational Education and Training in Developing World, Mrs Swati Sharma .....  | 9         |
| What is the future for territories through lifelong learning? Example of a “learning territory”, Mrs Esther Dubois .....  | 12        |
| <b>5. Questions/answers, comments and discussion .....</b>  | <b>13</b> |
| <b>6. The Dual system in the right to education: which procedures?.....</b>   | <b>16</b> |
| The dual system of vocational education and training (VET) as a right to education: The interest for a cross-regional Declaration in 2016, Mrs Claire de Lavernette.....                                    | 16        |
| Towards the adoption of a Resolution at the Human Rights Council in 2017 on the role of Dual System of Vocational Education and Training (VET) in realizing the right to education, Dr. Kishore Singh ..... | 17        |
| <b>7. Conclusion and recommendations of the High-level Panel of April 29: the agenda for 2016-2017 .....</b>  | <b>18</b> |
| <b>8. Closing speech.....</b>   | <b>18</b> |



## 1. General Context

Since 2010, Apprentissages Sans Frontières (ASF) follows very closely the issues of technical and professional education in the context of the right to education and the transmission of knowledge and technical skills, with a particular attention to promote apprenticeship's opportunities during all stages of life.

As a response to youth unemployment in the developing countries, ASF proposes the “dual apprenticeship” model as a solution. ASF underlines the need to recognize the right to apprenticeship as part of the right to education. To promote its project, ASF organized two High Level Panels during the 19<sup>th</sup> and 22<sup>nd</sup> sessions of the Human Rights Council. Those Panels received the support and the presence of high level experts and personalities from different countries as well as the presence of the Special Rapporteur on the right to education at the United Nations, Dr. Kishore SINGH.

The first international High Level Panel took place the 20<sup>th</sup> of March 2012 during the 19<sup>th</sup> session of the Human Right Council of the United Nations in Geneva. Called “The Realization of the Apprenticeship through the Right to Education: a New Challenge?”, it allowed to underline the importance of the education through apprenticeship for the youth in the economic and social development of the developing countries. It also helped to build awareness in the international community about the importance of the “dual apprenticeship” in technical teaching. This was done with the scope of developing a legal basis for the right to apprenticeship inside the United Nations system in order to improve its implementation in developing countries. The Special Rapporteur on the right to education at the United Nations, Dr. Kishore Singh, mentioned for the first time the right to apprenticeship in his 2012's Annual Report to the General Assembly of the United Nations on technical and vocational education in the perspective of the right to education. In this context, he recognized the apprenticeship as an integral part of teaching and of technical and vocational education and thus being an integral part of the right to education (report A/67/310).

The second international High Level Panel took place the 12<sup>th</sup> of March 2013 during the 22<sup>nd</sup> session of the Human Right Council. The Panel focused on the issues of the Valorization of Apprenticeship, a Strategy to Meet the Objectives of the Right to Education: followed by the Report of the Special Rapporteur on Technical and Vocational Education Teaching in the perspective of the right to education (report A/67/310). One of the Panel's main objectives was to induce a constructive and multidisciplinary reflexion on the theme of education and of training via apprenticeship. Furthermore, it also allowed to emphasize the central role of apprenticeship as a way to promote integration and to fight against school failure and social exclusion.

This event showed that the political, economic, social, cultural and legal context were favorable to the preparation of a resolution for the Human Right Council on the right to education by dual apprenticeship before the end of 2017. We are aware that in the objective number 4 of the Sustainable Development Goals, the word “apprenticeship” is used. However, we believe that this objective is not implemented enough, because of the declarative character of the Goals. In this context, proposing a resolution/declaration on the right to dual apprenticeship is an important and a smart step in giving a legal and political basis to this notion and in improving its implementation.

The High Level Panel “Dual Apprenticeship: a part of the Right to education. Challenges and perspectives” was organized to sensitize and encourage the representatives of the permanent Missions to elaborate and depose a resolution/declaration project on the dual apprenticeship as a way to educate and as part of the right to education.

## **2. Opening statements and introduction**

His Excellency Ambassador Mr. Negash Kebret BOTORA (Ambassador Permanent Representative of the Permanent Mission of the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia to the United Nations Office and other international organizations in Geneva and Vice-President of the Human Rights Council) takes the floor and begins by welcoming all attendees and thanking them all for their participation. He also thanks Apprentissages Sans Frontières (ASF) for having selected him as moderator.

According to His Excellency, the topic of the day is Dual Apprenticeship: a right to education. Challenges and perspectives. Apprenticeship is becoming a critical issue. To implement Dual Apprenticeship for 2030, we have to overcome challenges. He argues that it is time to recognize Dual Vocational Education and Training (Dual VET) as a key factor in access to knowledge. The benefits of Dual Vocational Education and Training are quite relevant. Through Dual VET the learner develops practical skills. Experience shows that Dual VET achieves important results, for example by instilling a good attitude in the learner along with all the qualities required of a worker. Furthermore, the companies -get to know apprentices better and in return they can contribute to the learning. He argues that internationally the present event could help foster cooperation and facilitate the recognition of Dual VET.

The Ambassador M. Batora concludes by asking the panelists to consider all the aspects of Dual VET and to recommend specific solutions. Finally, he hopes that the Panel will result in successful cooperation.

Dr. Alpha DRAME (General Secretary of Apprentissages Sans Frontières (ASF)) takes the floor and underlines the importance of this event as an essential step towards the recognition of Dual VET as a right to education, after having been initiated by ASF, in 2012, in collaboration with the Special Rapporteur on the right to education, Dr. Kishore Singh. Dr. Dramé wishes to work with States in order to move towards a draft of a Cross-regional Declaration on the role of Dual System of Vocational Education and Training in realizing the right to statement. According to him, it is essential, at this High-Level Panel, to really understand what Dual VET is and to underline its importance for the right to education since it is a cross-regional system which is easily adaptable. The aim is to provide a new dimension to the right to education, which is the right to Dual VET.

Dual VET represents, for ASF, the means by which young people could acquire training, and then employment, and this in balance with the economy of the country where they live.

This Panel represents an opportunity to once again underline that having the expertise of States is important and that we have to collaborate closely with the Special Rapporteur on the right to education to eventually move towards a resolution in 2017. The latter would bring a legal framework and would allow an implementation of Dual VET in developing countries.

He concludes by extending special gratitude to the Ambassador of the Permanent Delegation of the African Union, who allowed for the organization of this Panel. He would also like to show his recognition to the Permanent Mission of the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia, and specially S.E.M Negash Kebret Batora whose Ambassador is chairing the Panel, for supporting this process since the beginning. He also thanks the speakers who have accepted to participate in this Panel in order to clarify the concept of Dual VET, which remains a little unclear. He hopes that this educational approach would help the countries to consider this issue in order to establish a political statement, which would allow an implementation in developing countries. He also expressed his tanks to Kvalito company, which has kindly offered refreshments, in order to conclude this Panel in the best possible way.

His Excellency Mr. Jean-Marie EHOZOU (Ambassador Permanent Observer of the Permanent Delegation of the African Union to the United Nations Office and other international organizations in Geneva) begins by thanking those who prepared this event. He estimates that the issue regarding Dual VET is quite simple. Today we observe that Africa's population is made of almost 70 % of young people, whose main preoccupation is to find a sustainable employment. Generally, these young people in search of social welfare go down the path of forced exile, because there are no other options apart from social welfare elsewhere. Furthermore, in Africa, due to weak economic growth and high unemployment, these young people find themselves wandering in the streets of large rural towns. They end up in vulnerable employment situations or pursuing criminal activities. They don't have an occupation and it is easy for jihadist militias to manipulate them. Moreover the number of jihadist militants is increasing in African societies. According to him, the reason for this situation is the lack of economic opportunity and the inadequacy between training and the needs of the job-market.

In Africa, the current situation is that young graduates have acquired only theoretical knowledge during their studies and do not have any of the practical knowledge required by enterprises and industries.

Training does not involve employment. The young students graduating from university or secondary school cannot find employment, because they only have basics sciences capabilities. We call them unemployed graduates. They sometimes have to retrain or, by necessity, find themselves in a vulnerable employment situation. Dual VET gives sustainable solutions to young unemployed people or to those who have an uncertain future. It is essential today to approach this issue that characterizes Africa as a whole and above all young people, who are the driving force of African societies and Africa's economic future.

Dr. Kishore SINGH (Special Rapporteur on the right to education) congratulates ASF for this important initiative which is linked to his own preoccupations and rejoices about this collaboration with ASF. He focuses on the quality of education, which is a priority for his work. More precisely, he is currently working on technical and vocational training efficiency, as well as on skills development. According to him, attention should be paid to facilitating and prioritizing skills acquisition in such a way as to obtain the required quality. He concludes his introductory speech by expressing a sincere wish to improve standard-setting actions in collaboration with governments and all the relevant actors.

### **3. Thematic presentation**

Dr. Alpha Dramé takes the floor. First, he sets out to clarify the thematic at hand. Generally, the word apprenticeship has negative connotations. It can therefore be seen in some countries that apprenticeship exists and is enhanced. He specifies that apprenticeship corresponds to a Dual VET system and its worth is due to a training part and an employment part. He adds that countries like Switzerland, Austria and Germany use this system and are the “drivers” of the western economy. They benefit from Dual VET, which is in accordance with young people’s training and employer’s needs.

He continues by underlining that, despite the existence of the right to education in developing countries, more than 80 percent of their economy remains based on the informal sector, which includes all the unrecognized training in the economy (painters, mechanics, etc.). This informal sector is supplied by Dual VET. By comparing the Swiss vocational training system and the African system, we can notice that the difference stands in the recognition of the training process. Indeed, in Africa, the apprentice is the one who failed in school and is then brought by his father to a master, in order to learn a practical job. If we are referring to the Swiss system, it is the same system but in a formal way, through vocational training systems. The African economy works because its apprentices have effective certified employability skills, but these competences are not recognized by formal training, which is not “connected with the employment” like Dual VET.

Dr. Dramé insists on the need to internationally recognize the importance of Dual VET. According to him, if the others continents want to improve their socio-economic situation, Dual VET would be very helpful. He concludes by reminding that the aim of this High-Level Panel is to work together to include the right to Dual VET at the United Nations in the right to education.

#### **4. Experiencing training through Dual VET: a practical reality**

**Intervention of Mrs. Natacha JUDA, Secretary of the Interprofessional Council on Training of the Geneva Departement for Public Instruction, Culture and Sports (Conseil Interprofessionnel pour la formation (CIF) du Département de l’instruction publique, de la culture et du sport, Canton et République de Genève) :**

##### **Vocational training in the context of Switzerland: the example of the Canton of Geneva**

Mrs. Juda sets out to explain the Dual VET system in the Swiss context. She begins by defining the concept “Dual VET”. This word means a training which is carried in parallel in a company and in a vocational training school. Knowledge and skills are acquired both in enterprise and in school. Learners spend on average three to four days per week at the company, where they acquire practical professional skills. At the same time, they get actively involved in the production process of the enterprise. The vocational training school provides the vocational training content, which includes the teaching of professional knowledge and general knowledge. The school also provides learners with the theoretical bases which are necessary to perform the employment. Learners go to school in average one to two days per week.

Dual VET is a training system too and it has a major importance in the Swiss education system. It has been created to directly enter the job market or to proceed with further trainings through connection.



Vocational and technical training in Switzerland and in Geneva is part of the upper secondary level (initial vocational training) and of the tertiary level (advanced professional training). It is based on training for nationally recognized qualifications and procedures.

The large permeability of this system is one of its relevant characteristics. Indeed it is possible to receive more or less demanding offers of training, to move from vocational training to higher education. This permeability encourages learners and professional's mobility and help to avoid dead-ends.

In Switzerland, two-thirds of young people choose an initial vocational training. Dual VET, which mainly takes place in companies, is the most popular form of training in Switzerland. Vocational and educational training can also take place in vocational schools on a full-time basis. The proportions are a little different in Geneva where more young people (about 50%) choose this last option (i.e. vocational and technical training and training at school on a full-time basis).

Dual VET in Switzerland is possible in almost all professional fields. The most popular sectors for young people in Switzerland but also in the Canton of Geneva are commerce, retail sales and healthcare.

Vocational and technical training is based on a partnership between three actors: labor organizations, the Swiss Confederation and the Cantons. These three partners join their efforts to provide a quality training in accordance with the economy.

This principle of partnership and the responsibilities of the various actors are settled in a federal law dedicated to VET and its ordinance. The Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) has noticed, in two recent researches, that the joint involvement of all partners in Switzerland is a major strength of the Swiss training system. Another characteristic of the Swiss vocational training and education system is the voluntary commitment of labor organizations (industry associations/unions). They define the content of training and national qualifications procedures. They also develop new offers of training, in accordance with the needs of the job market. Their role is therefore essential.

The Swiss Confederation is in charge of the steering and the strategic development of vocational training and education. Exam regulations and the study program of higher vocational training are defined at national level. The Swiss Confederation also provides one quarter of public spending in this area. Cantons, at the regional level, are in charge of implementation and monitoring the field. The vocational training and education authorities of the 26 Cantons approve apprenticeship contracts and provide information and advice to young people and adults. Vocational schools also play an important role since they provide the more academic part of vocational training and education. It is also at cantonal level that preparatory classes for young people with social and academic problems are implemented. Cantons ensure the greater part of public spending (three-quarters) for vocational training.

The close link between the needs of the economy and Dual VET is another characteristic of this system. This link is the key of its dynamism and flexibility. The working world is facing rapid changes and severe global competition. Structural changes in economy have a direct impact on vocational training and education programs. The needs of the economy determine the training contents, the competencies to be

acquired, the number of trainees, their allocation to various sectors and the development of new professions.

One might ask why young people are trained by companies. In Switzerland, forty percent of companies which are able to train are training young people. As a matter of fact, small and medium-sized enterprises represent the greatest providers of apprenticeship positions in Switzerland. However, the offer of companies providing training still remains lower in Geneva. The canton has been implementing? For several years a series of measures to encourage training efforts and a record number of contracts has since been signed.

The advantages of companies exist at several levels. By providing training, they ensure continuity for themselves (companies have difficulty finding qualified staff) but also for the profession as a whole. Indeed, if many young people don't stay in the companies after completing training, a several number return to them or work in other companies within the same sector.

The profitability of training young people is a further core element. A Swiss study on the costs and benefits of Dual VET in 2009 shows that the gross cost of training amounts to 5.3 billion Swiss francs, while trainees produce 5.8 billion Swiss francs through their activities. The net income for Swiss companies is then 0,5 billion Swiss francs. However, we have to specify that it is an average and that there are several differences between the different training courses (length for instance: an initial Dual VET course can last two, three or four years) and also depending on the professions. Generally speaking, we can say that the learner becomes profitable for the company from the second or third year of training.

Another key of the vocational education and training system's success is that the apprentices benefit from the apprenticeship. While benefiting from a quality education and training, they also receive an apprentice salary (which can vary from 400 to 1000 Swiss francs monthly for the first year of training). When young people finish their training, they already have a professional experience and the required skills, are flexible and have the best chance to find a job on the labor market.

To conclude, Mrs. Juda specifies that Switzerland has the lowest youth unemployment rates in the world and that this is due to the strong connection between vocational education and training and the labor market. The Swiss economy is characterized by its high competitiveness, its strong innovative capacity and its low unemployment rate. This success is due to the quality of the educational system, which provides basic training and lifelong training for all players.

### **Intervention of Mr. Aboubacar BARRY, Minister-Counsellor of the Permanent Mission of the Republic of Senegal to the United Nations Office and other international organizations in Geneva:**

#### **Current reforms regarding vocational education and training policies in Senegal**

Mr. Barry starts by explaining the current reforms regarding vocational education and training in Senegal. He agrees that Senegal is not the best known example for best practices in the area. However, there is

an attempt to establish a Dual VET system, in particular with the implementation of a several number of dedicated institutions and schools. He also mentions different experiences of cooperation with a number of partners, including India, which allowed to establish a training school, but also with Japan, whose cooperation helps to train a number of engineers.

In Africa, young children usually follow their parents in their professions. That is how African societies work. The child is initiated into these professions without theoretical knowledge, with practical training prevailing. However, this system does not promote economic development. Several initiatives have been taken by Senegal to reinforce the cooperation with its partners to offer better job opportunities to young people. In this perspective, Senegal initiated a plan in which the issue of vocational and technical training is at the top of its political agenda. The government wants to facilitate the hiring possibilities from the private sector.

Switzerland provides the most striking example in terms of success. Therefore Senegal has decided to develop the conditions of access to vocational and technical training with Switzerland. The idea is to train a high number of young people in the vocational and technical training system and to implement by 2016 a dual system which combines training at work and at school. In Senegal, the experiment of Dual VET, which underlines the importance of employment for the young people's professional project, is currently generating high hopes.

To formalize a cooperation between Switzerland and Senegal a training partnership has been signed between the Senegalese Minister of Foreign Affairs and its Swiss counterpart. The aim of this partnership is to allow the establishment of a Dual VET system in Senegal with the support of Swiss expertise. In this context, the Swiss Federal Department of Foreign Affairs has mandated the Canton of Vaud, the Swiss Federal Institute for Vocational Education and the NGO Apprentissages Sans Frontières to accompany Senegal along the different steps needed to implement a Dual VET system.

The objectives were the following. First, to assess the constraints of Senegalese institutions regarding Dual VET to promote the involvement of young people by employment and training. Second, to elaborate a roadmap to develop a strategy in order to establish a Dual VET system. The third objective was to set up a pilot project through the creation of a Dual VET-dedicated high school. The latter is currently being implemented at 80 km of Dakar and would be the first noticeable result of the Swiss-Senegal partnership. The fourth and last objective was the creation of a monitoring and recommendations framework which would allow an effective transfer of data and knowledge in favor of youth and employment.

Mr. Barry concludes by wondering how we can promote Dual VET without giving the impression of creating a new right, which could make the situation more complicated.

#### **Intervention of Mrs. Swati SHARMA, Chairperson of the Nishkam Foundation, India:**

#### **The Role of Dual System of Vocational Education and Training in Developing World**

Mrs. Sharma begins by expressing her gratitude to Apprentissages Sans Frontières for inviting her to the High-Level Panel on Dual Apprenticeship: A Right to Education – Challenges and Perspectives, and giving

her the opportunity to share her professional experience in this context. It is very gratifying for her that this event gives high priority to apprenticeship and skills development, which are her specialty areas.

According to Mrs. Sharma, there is widespread concern today with developing skills necessary for a country's development. This concern is also expressed in the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development, which recognizes the key importance of skills development: "by 2030 substantially increase the number of youth and adults who have relevant skills, including technical and vocational skills, for employment, decent jobs and entrepreneurship".

According to her, the momentum and engagement for skills development by the Post-2015 Sustainable Development Agenda should be leveraged to engage States more resolutely for responding to the rising aspiration of youth and for creating a better future for them. Skill development through technical and vocational education and training (TVET) is emerging as an area of critical importance to meet the challenges of an increasingly globalized economy. She mentions that quality apprenticeships based on robust social dialogue and public-private partnerships help young people overcome the work-inexperience trap that blocks their transition from education to employment.

According to her experience, Mrs. Sharma believes that traditional styles of classroom-confined teaching and exam-based certification cannot deliver technical skills necessary for empowering individuals and transforming societies with a focus on hands-on learning, and training in skills that lead to employability and livelihood generation. This is the kind of participatory and student-focused educational model that can allow individuals to contribute to society and feel genuinely empowered.

She says that when apprenticeship is managed by the social partners within a democratically determined legislative framework, benefits to young people are considerable. A number of recent studies confirm that a completed apprenticeship greatly increases a young person's chance of being employed.

According to her, the experience of Australia, Switzerland, Austria, Germany, and several other countries shows that we must also recognize that apprenticeship and vocational training are a very important part of skill development for which demands are huge. In Australia, vocational education and training is mostly post-secondary and within registered training organizations. The training packages are preponderantly publicly funded and the crucial feature is that the content of the vocational qualifications is defined by industry and not by the government or training providers.

She thinks that it is remarkable that in almost all the developed countries, vocational education is based on a « dual system » in which learners necessarily receive instruction and undergo training both in education and training institutions as well as in companies. She believes that this kind of « dual system » in which learners necessarily receive instruction and undergo training both in education and training institutions as well as in companies must be made imperative in any vocational training program. Developing countries should progressively advance with a similar approach, if they have to make technical and vocational education relevant to the working world.

She mentions India's policy approaches, for example, which are centered on reforming Vocational Education and Training (VET). Persisting skills gaps in education in India have brought undergoing major

reforms, with the goal of better aligning the skills of the local workforce with the needs of industry, while also trying to improve the social esteem and perceived value of TVET. This is underpinned by the vision of the Prime Minister who has stated that “Skilling is building a better India; if we have to move India towards development, skill development should be our mission”. The National Skill Development and Entrepreneurship Policy 2015 reflects this transformative process, bringing the world of education and training closer to the working world.

She argues that improving the status and the economic relevance of TVET is a major concern in developing world. The stigma attached to TVET as an alternative to academic education is a constraint on operationalizing it. Its poor quality is a major contributory factor to its lower status as the (educational) choice of last resort. At present, the vocational system does not put much emphasis on academic skills, resulting in lower incidences of vertical mobility.

According to her, resources are indispensable for giving a boost to skills development. TVET success depends on available infrastructure, adequate equipment, proper teaching materials and well-trained and qualified teaching staff, for example, setting up state of the art education centers and providing modern teaching materials and methods.

She believes that access to TVET must be made wider: policies should promote access to TVET particularly by disadvantaged sections of the society, such as women, economically and socially backward people, people living in rural or urban poverty, working children and persons with disabilities; this being a major concern.

She argues that forging sustainable linkages between TVET institutions and companies is essential for making the system of TVET more responsive to the demand for skills, as well as better capacitated for contributing to industrial development.

For instance, her recent project work involves one of the largest commercial vehicle manufacturers in India - Ashok Leyland, where the project established a workshop, customized to training service personnel for the eastern markets. What is important for her is to engage with the industry as a stakeholder. She says that the driving spirit in such partnerships should be the contribution to industrial and economic growth as an overall objective shared and jointly accomplished by public authorities and the private sector with convergence of interests. This success story was mentioned on the website of the Ministry of Skills Development and Entrepreneurship of India as a case study.

According to Mrs. Sharma, skill development programs necessarily involve close collaboration with industry and companies under the overall coordinating role of government. The institutionalized collaboration between TVET institutions and companies or industry is very weak in most developing countries, whereas this is a key to running these programs in a fruitful manner, as demonstrated by the policy and programmatic approaches in developed countries, notably Switzerland, Austria, Germany, Australia, Nordic and several other developed countries. In conducting TVET programs, where industry and companies collaborate with government, the partnership is not propelled by private interest but by industrial and economic growth as an overall objective shared and jointly accomplished by public authorities and the private sector.

She says that the “Dual System”, as practiced in industrialized countries such as Austria, Australia, Germany and Switzerland in which students, while pursuing a TVET program, undergo an apprenticeship in a company is premised upon PPP (Public-Private Partnership). This grants the system with the huge potential for the private sector to contribute to school infrastructure and equipment’s, TVET instructors’ training programs as well as giving student stipends when they undergo training within a company. Private partners from industry and companies can also contribute to TVET school development programs, particularly when such companies maintain partnerships with foreign companies.

She recommends that governments in developing countries meet the challenge of establishing and strengthening TVET institutions through PPPs by working closely with industry and companies, with the objective to impart skills and foster entrepreneurship. Public policies especially in the developing world can draw upon the work of international agencies such as the World Bank, UNESCO and ILO. She argues that the role of Information and Communication Technologies (ICTs) in the field of Technical Vocational Education and Training (TVET) is very vital. It enhances learning and provides a good support to achieve educational goals.

She concludes by stressing that education is a social responsibility and should be shared by all stakeholders in education including corporate sector. While the private sector should be harnessed for imparting skills, care should be taken that their programs effectively contribute to safeguarding education as a societal good and to national development.

**Intervention of Mr. Yves ATTOU, Mrs Esther DUBOIS, respectively President and Representative of the World Committee for Lifelong Apprenticeships, France (Comité Mondial pour les Apprentissages tout au long de la vie, France)**

**What is the future for territories through lifelong learning? Example of a “learning territory**

Mr. Attou begins by presenting his organisation, the Comité Mondial pour les Apprentissages tout au long de la vie (CMA), created in 2005 in partnership with UNESCO, which is today represented in 72 countries and leads reflexions and actions in favor of the promotion of lifelong learning.

Similarly to Apprentissages Sans Frontières, the CMA organize its action in accordance with the UN sustainable development goals and particularly in accordance with the Goal number 4, to provide quality education.

According to him, Dual VET is the most efficient training because it is unanimously accepted in almost all countries and in the different chains of companies. A majority of teachers of traditional education recognize that Dual VET is the most effective training. This “Dual” training combines theoretical knowledge and practical skills by removing barriers of the academic, economic and civil sectors.

A lot of countries are suffering from the fact that their business leaders do not recognize the competencies developed by the traditional system of education and from the fact that a lot of teachers do not consider companies to be educative. Nowadays there is a global mutation, and it is becoming recognized that companies and also work are educative. And if this idea is admitted, then a Dual VET system should be the solution. For instance, in France 80% of young people accede to employment when they complete their apprenticeship contract. The facts stands that Dual VET succeeds and the UN should be taking

these evolutions into account. Indeed, the sustainable development goals, more particularly Goal number 4 “Quality Education”, mention lifelong learning but do not refer to Dual VET. Similarly, the UNESCO report “Rethinking education: Towards a global common good?” does not refer to training. A major advocacy effort must be done to at least incorporate this idea in the texts.

At the international level, there are structural changes. Previously, the life cycle was divided into four distinct periods, namely family, studies, work and retirement. Today there will be more alternating between employment and unemployment. Furthermore it is recognized today that a person will have in average seven different employments in his or her working life. This observation underlines the need for perpetual learning, perpetual training hence the idea of lifelong learning that the Comité Mondial pour les Apprentissages tout au long de la vie (CMA) is supporting.

Mr. Attou concludes by welcoming the UN advances in terms of quality education legitimacy. However, he warns of the declarative aspect and suggests the implementation of assessment systems and progress indicators.

Mrs. Dubois bases her presentation on the relationship to the territory. The CMA has developed a program of “1000 lifelong learning networks” based on learning territory. According to her, it is essential in this dimension of Dual VET to add the component of relationship to the territory. Thus, the CMA would add a fourth element to training, the territory. The lifelong learning territory is a living open space without borders, which is inspiring innovations processes through interactions networks which are permeable in the research of a shared and common goal. Man is a part of a territory as a source of creation, he is not simply an actor, he is also the author of his own life and the author of his own training, of his own training path. Thus there is a dual objective of lifelong learning territory. First, it should create the necessary conditions for a transformation, in a perspective of sustainable, social, individual, ecological, industrial but also collective development. The aim is also that this process should generate in action.

The territories of tomorrow will have new forms of organization which won't be necessarily institutional. Therefore, the will of the CMA is to overcome these forms to develop lifelong learning. We should understand learning in plural form, because there would be several learnings touching all different phases of life (professional, personal, citizen...).

## **5. Questions/answers, comments and discussion**

His Excellency Mr. Sammie EDDICO, Ambassador of the Permanent Mission of the Republic of Ghana to the United Nations Office and other international organizations in Geneva, finds the issue of professional training relevant, especially because Africa generates many unemployed youths who find their way to Europe. In order to stop this exodus, it is necessary to find a way to create jobs on the continent. He also remarks that training is secondary in Africa, a choice of last resort after failing at university. Today, we have a proliferation of universities that train young people; however, at the end of their studies there is no connection with the companies and industries so they end up unemployed. These young people are called “unemployable graduates”. The Ambassador Mr. Sammie Eddico proposes as a

solution to the stigma of apprenticeship the possibility of providing financing to people who choose the road of professional training. He concludes his remarks with a question, namely, how to adapt these Swiss-German experiences to the local environment.

The First Secretary of the Permanent Mission of the Republic of Chad to the United Nations Office and other international organizations in Geneva, Mr. Awada ANGUI considers that as long as developing countries are not industrialized, we cannot link academic institutions to industries. Even if there are technical high schools, these are mainly theoretical high schools, according to him.

The First Secretary of the Permanent Mission of Portugal to the United Nations Office and other international organizations in Geneva, Mr. Nuno CABRAL wishes to come back to the interventions of the representatives of Ghana and Chad. He believes that the issue of professional training is a very wide topic and some aspects can be seen through the perspective of human rights. One of the fundamental characteristics is its universality. According to him, we must have it in mind in this process that we want to launch within the United Nations.

The Minister-Counsellor of the Permanent Mission of the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia to the United Nations Office and other international organizations in Geneva, Mr. Yibza Aynekullu TEFAYE wishes to point out that the dual VET system and the technical and vocational training system are already present in Africa. This is not a new situation. To this end, he gives the example of the farmer's son who learns the farming profession by his father. The dual VET is already present in Africa but it is not certified. He ended his speech by expressing the fear of leaving education to the private sector, which in Africa is reluctant to teach, especially for cost reasons. There is a danger according to him, to let this dual VET to the private sector because it will be seen as a way to make profits.

The Counsellor of the Permanent Mission of the Republic of Guinea to the United Nations Office and other international organizations in Geneva, Mr. Aboubacar CISSE recalls that the issue of professional training is a major preoccupation for all African governments. In most countries there is a department in charge of this issue: the technical education and professional training department. Since many years, this department has been struggling across countries to reduce youth unemployment by the apprenticeship system but without success so far. It is such a concern that the African Union has decided to focus on the matter today, and following the 26<sup>th</sup> sessions of the General Assembly it was decided that 2016, year of human rights with a major focus on the Convention on the Law of the African labor market, would be the year where solutions in order to formalize the apprenticeship system should be implemented. However, there is the question of how to make informal training in African countries more effective in the fight against poverty as in the Swiss or German systems.

Mr. Oumar BALDET, International Consultant and founder of Peace Support raises the feeling by listening to the different participants in the High-Level Panel that the dual apprenticeship system has been completely accepted, whereas according to him, it isn't that much. He believes that when we try to anchor dual apprenticeship by relying mainly on the economy, there is a concern beyond efficiency. As he explains, companies are spaces where the values aren't solid, where efficiency, competition, profits are privileged. He believes that training young people, within this framework, just for the needs of the business



is a limited ambition. We must, according to him, find a compromise, because when we speak of the right to education, education cannot simply be limited to economic efficiency.

Dr. Kishore Singh wants tacking stock of the comments of the Ambassador of Chad about the fact that a country must be developed so that it can be possible to link schools and industries. On the contrary, Dr. Singh believes that it isn't necessary for a country to be developed to be able to establish the dual apprenticeship system. It is the responsibility of Governments to play its coordinating role and create an environment favorable to Dual VET in the context of their efforts on basic education. When talking about the right to education, what is important according to him is to provide a quality education. It is about the whole education system that can transmit knowledge, values and but also skills.

Dr. Alpha Dramé considers that the issues are relevant and particularly points out the comment of the Ambassador of Ghana about the adaptability of the Swiss system to Africa. In Switzerland, the system is based on a concept of "win-win" between three actors, namely the State, the employers and the unions. The Swiss Confederation guarantees the education. It guarantees the right to quality education as based on the principles of democracy, justice and social equality of Switzerland. The economic sector participates in the creation of employment and it is the legally recognized actor who partakes in the dual training because it is the one who drives the economy. The unions meanwhile, secure jobs with dignity and respect of law. It is the consensus among these three actors around learning which makes it a valiant system.

According to Dr. Dramé, you cannot transfer the Swiss model in African countries; you can only transfer the principle. The principle is namely that the state, the employers and the unions can share both the benefits and costs of education. As regards the question of the industrialization of Africa as raised by the First Secretary of Chad, Dr. Dramé believes that the problem is a development problem in terms of financing and technology transfer. However, all this will be based on the educational factor. According to him, if their educational system is based on an elitism copied in the West, African countries won't be able to industrialize themselves. On the contrary, if we work on the informal sector to make dual training effective and certified, then African societies will be able to transform their local economies themselves.

The Ambassador of the Permanent Delegation of the African Union to the United Nations Office and other international organizations in Geneva, Mr. Jean-Marie Ehouzou returns to the questions asked by the Ambassador of Ghana and relayed by the Ambassador of Chad. He believes that everything is a question of investment. One cannot speak of industrialization in Africa without speaking of investment. In all developed countries, there are always training centers. We can only create training centers when we need to have specialties for vitalize the industry. According to him, it is not in the informal sector that we will create a training center. We must accelerate the industrialization of the continent and then create training centers. However, to industrialize African countries, we have to invest and to invest, resources are needed.

Mrs. Natacha Juda reacts on the remark of stigma and poor image of the apprenticeship. She notes that Switzerland and Geneva in particular are confronted with this fact. According to her, the solution lies in the fact that we must integrate Dual VET in the general education system. It has to be considered as a gateway that allows subsequently to evolve towards a highly demanding training, to a tertiary education.

According to her, it is also necessary to undertake promotional activities of training and involving public actors and professional associations also. She noted that the issue of stigma is also a question of proportion. Once a significant proportion of the population holds a Dual VET system, this stigma should diminish.

## **6. The Dual system in the right to education: which procedures?**

**Intervention of Mrs. Claire DE LAVERNETTE, the representative of OIDEL to the United Nations Office in Geneva:**

### **The dual system of vocational education and training (VET) as a right to education: The interest for a cross-regional Declaration in 2016**

Mrs. De Lavernette looks back at the previous two conferences organized by Apprentissages Sans Frontières, which she attended, and expresses the belief that it would be time today to move to a new stage. Namely, the introduction of dual apprenticeship in the resolution on the right to education or even in the resolution on the right to work. She suggests the idea of starting with a statement of all stakeholders to the High-Level Panel which could be the basis for Mr. Cabral so that he can integrate it into its resolution.

The adoption of a Cross-regional Declaration would also be particularly opportune today in the new context of the Development Agenda for 2030, because it is true that education and technical and vocational training are essential not only for the fulfilment of the right to education but also to achieve the overall objectives of sustainable development.

According to her, the declaration should aim, first of all, to remind States of the international standards of education and technical and vocational training and thus their obligations since they are an integral part of the right to education. It is already part of it, so there is no need to create a new right. There are over nine international standards that recognize it and it is not something new, it is as old as the article 26 of the Universal Declaration on Human Rights.

As is shown in the different texts and normative frameworks developed by UNESCO and ILO, and in the many recent initiatives at European level, but also in other parts of the world and particularly in Africa, Dual VET is now recognized. It is recognized as an integral part of general education. It isn't only secondary education that is concerned, but also primary, post-secondary and higher education. It is an aspect of learning throughout life. Dual VET is also a means of access to professional fields and for effective participation in the working world. It should be mentioned in the Declaration that it is not a burden for States but an investment with significant returns, including the well-being of workers, enhanced productivity and international competitiveness.

These few elements are only a part of what the existing standards mention, but we see that for States this implies a greater investment in terms of financial and human resources, but furthermore, this also means strengthening governance and expanding partnerships. This is why it would be good if we included in the Declaration that States must give high priority to technical and vocational education in national

development and in educational reform programs. To implement this model, even if it is already in the standards, it is necessary that the education system be taken into account.

Mrs. De Lavernette then touches on the objectives of sustainable development. She says that this Declaration would be quite opportune in the new international context of the Sustainable Development Goals. The UNESCO has already insisted, in its recommendation on the subject, on the fact that TVET (Technical and Vocational Education and Training) is an instrument to promote sustainable development, respect for the environment and a way to fight poverty. These points were also highlighted by the third Congress on Technical and Vocational Education and Training, held in May 2012 in Shanghai. It seems necessary to note the importance of this education to fight against all forms of poverty, not only economic poverty but also the poverty characterized by ignorance, exclusion, lack of access to basic healthcare, the inability to live as a free-thinking human, to reflect, to be responsible citizens, able to fit into a world in rapid mutation.

Under Objective 4, specially dedicated to education, technical and vocational education and training is mentioned several times. It is also mentioned in many of the seven targets that are specific to the objective. We therefore have all we need to make a good Declaration.

By 2030, there is much to do to harmonize, in matters of efficiency, quality and equity, this aspect of the right to education. An increasing number of scholarships offered to developing countries and African countries for vocational training and computer, technical and scientific courses, is required by 2020, so a short-term maturity for States

Mrs. De Lavernette finishes her speech by mentioning the importance of this type of education in the contribution to social cohesion and peace, which in her view, is the ultimate goal of all that is undertaken within the United Nations. Objective 4.7 of the Sustainable Development Goals specifically mentions the importance of this education to teach young people a culture of human rights and to develop active citizenship, promoting social cohesion and peace. She believes that technical and vocational education should not only be inspired by a merely utilitarian vision, but also by a humanist vision of education, not only to meet the technical requirements of the professional sectors, but also develop social skills and critical thinking. This last comment applies to all countries, whether developing or developed.

#### **Intervention of Dr. Kishore SINGH, United Nations Special Rapporteur on the right to education:**

##### **Towards the adoption of a Resolution at the Human Rights Council in 2017 on the role of Dual System of Vocational Education and Training (VET) in realizing the right to education**

Dr. Singh considers that it is up to governments to implement active measures. They are the actors that have to adopt the idea of Cross-regional Declaration. We now have a better understanding of how we can learn from each region.

He takes a look at the various norms of international law, such as the International Conventions in the field of Human Rights, which gives certain legal obligations for States. There are also various political statements and commitments that are not legally binding but have a value and a moral force. He estimates that there is enough material to develop a normative framework on the right to apprenticeship in the context of education and technical and vocational education teaching.

According to Dr. Singh, it would be helpful if a legal basis on the right to professional and technical learning existed. What is needed today is an internationally recognized framework in the whole world, under the responsibility of States. Therefore, all stakeholders must take responsibility for establishing a dual apprenticeship system as being an integral part of the teaching system.

## **7. Conclusion and recommendations of the High-level Panel of April 29: the agenda for 2016-2017**

Mr. Biro DIAWARA (Main Representative of Apprentissages Sans Frontières at the United Nations Office in Geneva) believes that it is important today to move towards the adoption of a Cross-regional Declaration. At least, he expresses the hope, given the interest shown and the importance given to the topic by all delegations and participants attending the High-Level Panel that we go down this road.

Thereafter, he puts forward the idea that by placing the right to education at the center of the 2030 development agenda, we will be able to guarantee and ensure a future of peace and social cohesion for the new generation.

He finishes his speech by mentioning the need to promote and foster cooperation between developed and developing countries in order to advance towards the Dual VET model of technical and vocational training. A model which is, according to him, of great use as the main driving force of economic and industrial development.

## **8. Closing speech**

Mr. Negash Kebret BOTORA (Ambassador, Permanent Representative of the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia to the United Nations Office at Geneva) thanks Mr. Biro DIAWARA and the rest of the panelists and participants of the High-Level Panel. He personally believes that the Panel was of great help. There are certainly challenges concerning the establishment of a normative framework for a right to learn, but there are also great opportunities. He calls for further discussions and reflexions in this aim.